

AGENDA ITEM: B

HEARING DATE: April 6, 2015
Continued from March 2, 2015

OWNER/APPLICANT: PHILIP ENGELBERT
2508 TUOLUMNE DRIVE
CHICO, CA 95973

AGENT: THOMAS THOMSON
799 HILL VIEW WAY
CHICO, CA 95926

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: A request to construct a 2,248 square-foot single-family residence with decking, garage, driveway, and pump house - water storage tank enclosure on a 0.41 acre lot.

STREET ADDRESS: 44825 Pine Street (APN 119-150-41)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES: Site consists of a vacant lot
South: Category S, Evergreen Cemetery

PARCEL SIZE: 0.41 acre lot. 0.30 net acre site (excluding panhandle access).

CEQA STATUS: A Class 3 Categorical Exemption, per Section 15303(a), for a single-family residence in a residential zone.

HISTORIC ORDINANCE STANDARDS: The Mendocino Historical Preservation District Ordinance provides standards for the MHRB to consider when reviewing application. Relative to this application, the following issues are raised and should be addressed:

- | | |
|---|--------------------|
| ✓ Building Size, Height, Proportions and Form | ✓ Roof Shape |
| Relationship of Building Masses and Open Spaces | ✓ Color(s) |
| ✓ Relationship to Surrounding Structures | Sign Size |
| ✓ Materials and Textures | Number of Signs |
| ✓ Architectural Details and Style | Placement/Location |
| ✓ Facade Treatment | ✓ Lighting |
| ✓ Proportions of Windows and Doors | ✓ Paving/Grading |
| Landscaping | |

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF MHRB GUIDELINES: Building Design (pages 7-9)

STAFF NOTES: After extensive deliberation during the March 2, 2015 MHRB meeting, the applicant's representative requested that the item be continued and the Board approved a motion continuing the item to April 6, 2015. The project architect considered the Board's discussion and has revised the proposal to construct a single-family home. Board Members will consider whether the proposed single-family residence and accessory structures are compatible with the historic district and conform with Chapters 20.656 Mendocino Multiple Family Residential (MRM), 20.704 Accessory Use Regulations, and 20.760 Historical Preservation District for Town of Mendocino.

The proposed residence will be a two story structure with 2,248 square-feet of conditioned space. The building color and outdoor lighting remain as presented to the Board on March 2, 2015.

The project architect submitted revised plans on March 9, 2015; architectural revisions include (1) increasing the pitch of the roof while keeping the proposed building height within district limitations; (2) adjusting the location of the second-floor south and east-facing master bedroom windows; (3) adding a shed dormer to the roof line above the master bathroom; (4) adding two new windows under the gables (one window on the south and one on the east elevation); and (5) calling out eyebrows above the windows.

These design changes respond to Board comments during their March 2, 2015 hearing. Staff Reports from the March 2, 2015 and the February 2, 2015 MHRB Meetings are attached for reference.

Building color: The March 2nd revised building colors remain unchanged. The residential structure will present with exterior redwood or cedar board and batten painted Wickham Gray (HC-171 Benjamin Moore). Window sashes will be painted Georgian Brick (HC-50 Benjamin Moore).

Outdoor lighting The March 2nd revised lighting remains unchanged. Outdoor lighting will include a dark bronze finish, shielded, and the glass frosted to reduce glare. The proposal includes substantially fewer driveway light stands; they are down-shielded light posts installed at forty-foot intervals. Three driveway light posts are shown. The Centennial LED step lights remain and a Hinkley dark-sky porch light is added. The proposed outdoor lighting satisfies Section 20.760.025 "exterior lighting designed to light the exterior of a structure, streets, pedestrian walkways, doorways, stairs, and similar areas."

Roof pitch: The architect previously presented roof pitch designs of 4:12, 6:12, and 7:12. The project roofline has been revised to a 7.5:12 pitch roof. This proposal satisfies the maximum allowed building height within the district.

Fenestration: The proposal includes two new windows that are situated below the gables on the home's south and east elevations.

The home's north elevation includes newly proposed shed dormer with three divided windows.

The north elevation, second floor window sizes remain as revised on March 2, 2015. The north elevation includes three (3) second-floor windows (one smaller and two larger rectangle-shaped windows).

The master bedroom bay windows that face south and east have been redesigned. The windows are further offset from the second floor corner of the home. The east facing second-floor master bed room window is narrower than previously presented. As mentioned previously, the east elevation includes a new window under the gable. Eyebrows are shown above all the windows.

REQUIRED FINDINGS: The Historical Review Board shall not approve or conditionally approve any application for proposed work unless it affirmatively makes the following findings:

- (a) The exterior appearance and design of the proposed work is in harmony with the exterior appearance and design of the existing structures within the District and with that of existing subject structure, if any; and
- (b) The appearance of the proposed work will not detract from the appearance of other property within the District; and
- (c) Where the proposed work consists of alteration or demolition of an existing structure, that such work will not unnecessarily damage or destroy a structure of historical, architectural or cultural significance.

STANDARD CONDITIONS:

1. This action shall become final and effective on the 11th day following the decision unless an appeal is filed pursuant to Section 20.760.072 of the Mendocino County Code. The permit shall expire and become null and void at the expiration of two years after the effective date except where construction and or use of the property in reliance on such permit has been completed prior to its expiration.
2. The application along with supplemental exhibits and related material shall be considered elements of this permit, and compliance therewith is mandatory.
3. This permit shall be subject to the securing of all necessary permits for the proposed development from County, State and Federal agencies having jurisdiction. The applicant shall secure all required building permits for the proposed project as required by the Building Inspection Division.
4. This permit shall be subject to revocation or modification upon a finding of any one (1) or more of the following:
 - a. That such permit was obtained or extended by fraud.
 - b. That one or more of the conditions upon which such permit was granted have been violated.
 - c. A final judgment of a court of competent jurisdiction has declared one (1) or more conditions to be void or ineffective, or has enjoined or otherwise prohibited the enforcement or operation of one (1) or more such conditions.

The Review Board's action and this permit will not be final and effective and work may not commence on the project until after a ten-day appeal period has ended. You will be notified if a timely appeal is filed.

Appeal Fee: \$1, 040.00 (Check payable to County of Mendocino)

Appeal Period: Appeals must be received by the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors within 10 days of Review Board action.

STAFF REPORT FOR MENDOCINO HISTORICAL REVIEW BOARD PERMIT

MHRB # 2014-20

AGENDA ITEM: A

HEARING DATE: March 3, 2015
Continued from February 2, 2015

OWNER/APPLICANT: Philip Engelbert
2508 Tuolumne Drive
Chico, CA 95973

AGENT: Thomas Thomson
799 Hill View Way
Chico, CA 95926

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: A request to construct a 2,248 square-foot single-family residence with decking, garage, driveway, and pump house - water storage tank enclosure on a 0.41 acre lot.

STREET ADDRESS: 44825 Pine Street (APN 119-150-41)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES: Site consists of a vacant lot
South: Category S, Evergreen Cemetery

PARCEL SIZE: 0.41 acre lot. 0.30 net acre site (excluding panhandle access).

CEQA STATUS: A Class 3 Categorical Exemption, per Section 15303(a), for a single-family residence in a residential zone.

HISTORIC ORDINANCE STANDARDS: The Mendocino Historical Preservation District Ordinance provides standards for the MHRB to consider when reviewing application. Relative to this application, the following issues are raised and should be addressed:

- | | |
|---|--------------------|
| ✓ Building Size, Height, Proportions and Form | ✓ Roof Shape |
| Relationship of Building Masses and Open Spaces | ✓ Color(s) |
| ✓ Relationship to Surrounding Structures | Sign Size |
| ✓ Materials and Textures | Number of Signs |
| ✓ Architectural Details and Style | Placement/Location |
| ✓ Facade Treatment | ✓ Lighting |
| ✓ Proportions of Windows and Doors | ✓ Paving/Grading |
| Landscaping | |

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF MHRB GUIDELINES: Building Design (pages 7-9)

STAFF NOTES: After extensive deliberation during the February 2, 2015 MHRB meeting, the applicant's representative requested that the item be continued. The project architect considered the Board's discussion and has revised the proposal to construct a single-family home. Board Members will consider whether the proposed single-family residence and accessory structures are compatible with the historic district and conform with Chapters 20.656 Mendocino Multiple Family Residential (MRM), 20.704 Accessory Use Regulations, and 20.760 Historical Preservation District for Town of Mendocino.

The proposed residence will be a two story structure with 2,248 square-feet of conditioned space. The interior floor plan is not revised. On February 5, 2015, the architect revised exterior color, roof pitch, exterior lighting, and fenestration. These design changes respond to Board comments during their February 2, 2015 hearing; the February 2, 2015 staff report is attached for reference.

Building color: The residential structure will present with exterior redwood or cedar board and batten painted Wickham Gray (HC-171 Benjamin Moore). Window sashes will be painted Georgian Brick (HC-50 Benjamin Moore). Previously, the color proposed was White Dove with the window sashes painted Conac Tibo.

Roof pitch: Previously proposed, the roof pitch was 4:12, which by definition is a regular sloped roof. The architect has explored two alternative roof pitches with more acute angles than previously drawn. The alternative roof pitches are 6:12 and 7:12 slopes. A study of 6:12 roof slope is presented on pages 10, 10.1, and 10.2. Compared to the original proposal, the 6:12 sloped roof projects lower to the ground and provides less differentiation between the fenestration and the eaves. This is especially exemplified by the north building elevations. A study of the 7:12 roof slope is presented on pages 11, 11.1, and 11.2. This more acute roof line increases the visibility of the roof area and diminishes the proportions of the building. Comparing building sections on pages 10.2 and 11.2, it is apparent that the 6:12 sloped roof is 6.75 feet in height and the 7:12 sloped roof is 8 feet in height. Additionally, the exterior wall height is reduced. As the roof pitch is made more acute, the roof area dominates the design and the vertical appearance of the building is flattened.

Outdoor lighting will include a dark bronze finish, shielded, and the glass frosted to reduce glare. The security lamp, Hinkley Ledgewood path light and wall sconces have been removed. The architect proposes substantially fewer driveway light stands; they are down-shielded light posts installed at forty-foot intervals. Three driveway light posts are shown. The Centennial LED step lights remain and a Hinkley dark-sky porch light is added. The proposed outdoor lighting satisfies Section 20.760.025 "exterior lighting designed to light the exterior of a structure, streets, pedestrian walkways, doorways, stairs, and similar areas."

Fenestration: The north elevation, second floor window size are changed (see page 10 or 11). The original proposal included four square-shaped windows with divided lights; the revised north elevation replaces two square-shaped windows with rectangle-shaped windows. The second floor bathroom windows remain unchanged.

REQUIRED FINDINGS: The Historical Review Board shall not approve or conditionally approve any application for proposed work unless it affirmatively makes the following findings:

- (a) The exterior appearance and design of the proposed work is in harmony with the exterior appearance and design of the existing structures within the District and with that of existing subject structure, if any; and
- (b) The appearance of the proposed work will not detract from the appearance of other property within the District; and
- (c) Where the proposed work consists of alteration or demolition of an existing structure, that such work will not unnecessarily damage or destroy a structure of historical, architectural or cultural significance.

STANDARD CONDITIONS:

1. This action shall become final and effective on the 11th day following the decision unless an appeal is filed pursuant to Section 20.760.072 of the Mendocino County Code. The permit shall expire and become null and void at the expiration of two years after the effective date except

where construction and or use of the property in reliance on such permit has been completed prior to its expiration.

2. The application along with supplemental exhibits and related material shall be considered elements of this permit, and compliance therewith is mandatory.
3. This permit shall be subject to the securing of all necessary permits for the proposed development from County, State and Federal agencies having jurisdiction. The applicant shall secure all required building permits for the proposed project as required by the Building Inspection Division.
4. This permit shall be subject to revocation or modification upon a finding of any one (1) or more of the following:
 - a. That such permit was obtained or extended by fraud.
 - b. That one or more of the conditions upon which such permit was granted have been violated.
 - c. A final judgment of a court of competent jurisdiction has declared one (1) or more conditions to be void or ineffective, or has enjoined or otherwise prohibited the enforcement or operation of one (1) or more such conditions.

The Review Board's action and this permit will not be final and effective and work may not commence on the project until after a ten-day appeal period has ended. You will be notified if a timely appeal is filed.

Appeal Fee: \$1, 040.00 (Check payable to County of Mendocino)

Appeal Period: Appeals must be received by the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors within 10 days of Review Board action.

STAFF REPORT FOR MENDOCINO HISTORICAL REVIEW BOARD PERMIT

MHRB # 2014-20

AGENDA ITEM: A

HEARING DATE: February 2, 2015
Continued from January 5, 2015

OWNER/APPLICANT: PHILIP ENGELBERT
2508 TUOLUMNE DRIVE
CHICO, CA 95973

AGENT: THOMAS THOMSON
799 HILL VIEW WAY
CHICO, CA 95926

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: A request to construct a 2,248 square-foot single-family residence with decking, garage, driveway, and pump house - water storage tank enclosure on a 0.41 acre lot.

STREET ADDRESS: 44825 Pine Street (APN 119-150-41)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES: Site consists of a vacant lot
South: Category S, Evergreen Cemetery

PARCEL SIZE: 0.41 acre lot. 0.30 net acre site (excluding panhandle access).

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: A Class 3 Categorical Exemption, per Section 15303(a), for a single family residence in a residential zone.

HISTORIC ORDINANCE STANDARDS: The Mendocino Historical Preservation District Ordinance provides standards for the MHRB to consider when reviewing application. Relative to this application, the following issues are raised and should be addressed:

- | | |
|---|--------------------|
| ✓ Building Size, Height, Proportions and Form | ✓ Roof Shape |
| Relationship of Building Masses and Open Spaces | ✓ Color(s) |
| ✓ Relationship to Surrounding Structures | Sign Size |
| ✓ Materials and Textures | Number of Signs |
| ✓ Architectural Details and Style | Placement/Location |
| ✓ Facade Treatment | ✓ Lighting |
| ✓ Proportions of Windows and Doors | ✓ Paving/Grading |
| Landscaping | |

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF MHRB GUIDELINES: Building Design (pages 7-9)

STAFF NOTES: Board Members will consider whether the proposed single-family residence and accessory structures are compatible with the historic district and conform with Chapters 20.656 Mendocino Multiple Family Residential (MRM), 20.704 Accessory Use Regulations, and 20.760 Historical Preservation District for Town of Mendocino.

- Single Family Residence

The proposed residence will be a two story structure with 2,248 square-feet of conditioned space. The main (or upper) floor includes dinning, sitting, breakfast (noted on the schematic as Bft Room), master bedroom with bath, and kitchen. The proposal includes redwood decking attached to the structure on the upper floor and a ground floor entry porch. The ground floor (or lower floor plan) includes the garage,

wood-screened 264 square-foot area for a water tank and utilities (noted on the schematic as “pump house and water tank”), a mechanical room, two bedrooms, bath, foyer and stair well.

The site has a five-foot elevation change with the ridgeline running north-south. The proposal is to absorb the elevation change within the building; thus two bedrooms are proposed on the ground level. The design concept proposes to evoke a rural setting with a building sited on a rise in elevation. Public views will not be impacted by the proposed design; existing and adjacent development shields views of the site. The residential structure will present with exterior redwood or cedar board and batten painted White Dove (PM-19 Benjamin Moore). Loewen (or equal) wood windows are proposed, with sashes painted Cognac Tibo (AF-235 Benjamin Moore). The roof pitch is 4:12, which by definition is a regular sloped roof. Medium grey composition shingles are proposed. A multi paneled, wooden garage door with four divided lites is proposed. The building form is designed to reflect the typical 22 by 25-foot building area within the Town of Mendocino.

Outdoor lighting will include a dark bronze finish, shielded, and the glass frosted to reduce glare. A security lamp is proposed to face empty lands; this vacant lot may have attracted overnight visitors due to its proximity to the highway. The outdoor lighting satisfies Section 20.760.025 “exterior lighting designed to light the exterior of a structure, streets, pedestrian walkways, doorways, stairs, and similar areas.”

Minimum front, rear, and side yards: The residence will be sited within the more restrictive boundaries determined at the time the lot was subdivided (application CDMS-13-95). The site is subject to a 50 by 50-foot building envelope situated in the approximate center of the lot.

Lot coverage: The residence will be sited within the boundaries of the allowed building envelope, which is determined by the subdivision (application CDMS-13-95). The building envelope is less than the maximum allowed lot coverage of 25% of the lot area.

Off street parking: One and a half (1.5) parking spaces are required. The garage (20.5 feet by 14.5 feet) is one parking space; the paved surfaces complete off-street parking area requirements. Pavement will consist of Black crushed granite. Special condition #1 of CDMS-13-95 (the subdivision application that created the subject property, known as Parcel 3), requires the applicant subdividing the land (Philip Engelbert) to construct a 10-foot wide, all weather driveway within the access strip serving Parcel 3, including a minimum 4-inch rock base.

➤ Historical Preservation and Design Guidelines

Pursuant to Section 20.760.030 work in Historical Zone A requires MHRB approval for the following: (A) *Construction ... of the exterior architecture of any building;* (C) *Any excavation of, or deposit of, material upon land as to materially alter the existing contour or condition of the land, including leveling, grading, piling, paving, or installation of retaining walls;* (E) *Walkways or driveways;* (G) *Any outdoor lighting;* (H) *Any painting of the exterior of a newly constructed building ...*

Pursuant to Section 20.760.050 *Standards ... shall be used by the Review Board when considering applications.* Generally the Standards, scheduled A through C, encompass size, forms, materials, textures, and colors; architectural elements and composition; and the following elements: height, proportions of windows and doors, relationship of building masses to open spaces, roof shape, landscaping, scale, directional expression, and architectural details. The Mendocino Town Design Guidelines provide examples to interpret Section 20.760.050(A) through (C) *Standards.*

Character of surrounding parcels: Directly east of the subject parcel is Highway One. To the south of the site is Evergreen Cemetery. Contiguous with the site’s westerly boundary is a residential lot which was developed in years 1999-2000. Directly north of the site, which is a lot with panhandle access, is a vacant lot.

Of the adjacent parcels, only Evergreen Cemetery is listed on the *Inventory of Historic Structures.* It is a category “S” designation, for which no definition is provided. Other similarly categorized historic structures are the site of the Alhambra Hotel; the site of Gus’ Saloon; the site of Boyd and Switzer Livery; the site of

Occidental Hotel; the site of Mendocino Grammar School; and others. The designation "S" may correlate with previously improved sites where the historic buildings no longer exist.

Other nearby historic structures include: the site of the Grammar School (mentioned above), the Packard Johnson House and Packard Gibbs House, and the JD Johnson Rental. All three of the existing buildings are designated as Category I on the *Inventory of Historic Structures*; and all show alterations. The Community Garden is northerly of the subject site, but not directly adjacent. Two lots westerly of the project site is a residence with a Category IIb designation; it is one of many bungalow type residences built in Town, but not of the Maine architectural style. This structure is historic because of its age.

REQUIRED FINDINGS: The Historical Review Board shall not approve or conditionally approve any application for proposed work unless it affirmatively makes the following findings:

- (a) The exterior appearance and design of the proposed work is in harmony with the exterior appearance and design of the existing structures within the District and with that of existing subject structure, if any; and
- (b) The appearance of the proposed work will not detract from the appearance of other property within the District; and
- (c) Where the proposed work consists of alteration or demolition of an existing structure, that such work will not unnecessarily damage or destroy a structure of historical, architectural or cultural significance.

STANDARD CONDITIONS:

1. This action shall become final and effective on the 11th day following the decision unless an appeal is filed pursuant to Section 20.760.072 of the Mendocino County Code. The permit shall expire and become null and void at the expiration of two years after the effective date except where construction and or use of the property in reliance on such permit has been completed prior to its expiration.
2. The application along with supplemental exhibits and related material shall be considered elements of this permit, and compliance therewith is mandatory.
3. This permit shall be subject to the securing of all necessary permits for the proposed development from County, State and Federal agencies having jurisdiction. The applicant shall secure all required building permits for the proposed project as required by the Building Inspection Division.
4. This permit shall be subject to revocation or modification upon a finding of any one (1) or more of the following:
 - a. That such permit was obtained or extended by fraud.
 - b. That one or more of the conditions upon which such permit was granted have been violated.
 - c. A final judgment of a court of competent jurisdiction has declared one (1) or more conditions to be void or ineffective, or has enjoined or otherwise prohibited the enforcement or operation of one (1) or more such conditions.

The Review Board's action and this permit will not be final and effective and work may not commence on the project until after a ten-day appeal period has ended. You will be notified if a timely appeal is filed.

Appeal Fee: \$1,040.00 (Check payable to County of Mendocino)

Appeal Period: Appeals must be received by the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors within 10 days of Review Board action.